
GUIDANCE AND QUESTIONNAIRE FOR GOVERNMENTS

The purpose of this questionnaire is to provide Member States with guidance for the preparation of national evaluation reports on the national implementation of the first phase of the World Programme for Human Rights Education.

I. GUIDANCE

1. Introduction – The World Programme for Human Rights Education


The General Assembly, in resolution 59/113B of 14 July 2005, adopted the revised draft Plan of Action\(^2\) for the first phase of the World Programme, which proposes a concrete strategy and practical ideas for implementing human rights education nationally. Resolution 59/113B, inter alia, encouraged “all States to develop initiatives within the World Programme and, in particular, to implement, within their capabilities, the Plan of Action” (para. 2) and appealed to “relevant organs, bodies or agencies of the United Nations system, as well as all other international and regional intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations, within their respective mandates, to promote and technically assist, when requested, the national implementation of the Plan of Action” (para. 4).

2. Background to the evaluation

The evaluation of the first phase of the World Programme for Human Rights Education is mandated both by the General Assembly and by the Human Rights Council as outlined below. The Plan of Action adopted for the first phase of the World Programme by all United Nations Member States through the General Assembly provides:

49. At the conclusion of the first phase (2005-2007) of the World Programme, each country will undertake an evaluation of actions implemented under this plan of action. The evaluation will take into consideration progress made in a number of areas, such as legal frameworks and policies, curricula, teaching and learning processes and tools, revision of

\(^{1}\) Although the first phase was initially launched for three years, until 2007, the Human Rights Council subsequently decided, its resolution 6/24 (28 September 2007) to extend the first phase of the World Programme by two more years until the end of 2009.

\(^{2}\) A/59/525/Rev.1 hereinafter referred to as “Plan of Action”. For easy reference, the Plan of Action may be accessed at http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Publications/PActionEducationen.pdf
textbooks, teacher training, improvement of the school environment, etc. The Member States will be called upon to provide their final national evaluation report to the United Nations inter-agency coordinating committee.

31. The inter-agency coordinating committee will prepare a final evaluation report based on national evaluation reports, in cooperation with relevant international, regional and non-governmental organizations. The report will be submitted to the General Assembly at its sixty-third session (2008).

The Human Rights Council in resolution 12/4 of 1 October 2009:

6. Reminds Member States of the need to prepare and submit their national evaluation reports on the first phase of the World Programme to the United Nations Inter-Agency Coordinating Committee on Human Rights Education in the School System by early 2010; and

7. Requests the Coordinating Committee to submit a final evaluation report of the implementation of the first phase of the World Programme, based on national evaluation reports, in cooperation with relevant international, regional and non-governmental organizations, to the General Assembly at its sixty-fifth session (autumn 2010).

This evaluation will be carried out by the United Nations Inter-Agency Coordinating Committee on Human Rights Education in the School System (UNIACC), for which the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) provides the secretariat.3

3. Content of evaluation

The aforementioned Plan of Action defines human rights education and outlines key actions to be undertaken by ministries of education and other school and civil society actors working in partnership to integrate human rights education effectively in the primary and secondary school systems. The UNIACC evaluation will therefore be based on national reporting on key elements drawn from the Plan of Action, namely the five main components of human rights education in the primary and secondary school systems, in the context of the minimum action which Member States are encouraged to undertake during the first phase of the World Programme.

3.1 Components of human rights education in the primary and secondary school systems

Human rights education promotes a rights-based approach to education. The Plan of Action provides at paragraph 18:

Therefore, human rights education in the primary and secondary school systems includes:

(a) Policies — developing in a participatory way and adopting coherent educational policies, legislation and strategies that are human rights-based, including curriculum improvement and training policies for teachers and other educational personnel;

3 UNIACC was established in September 2006, as mandated by the Plan of Action, to facilitate coordinated United Nations support to the national integration of human rights education in national school systems. The Inter-Agency Committee, for which OHCHR provides the Secretariat, is composed of 12 UN system entities and affiliated organizations, namely: ILO, OHCHR, UNAIDS, UNDG, UNDP, UNDPI, UNESCO, UNFPA, UNHCR, UNICEF, UNRWA, and the World Bank. The Council of Europe has participated as an observer.
(b) Policy implementation — planning the implementation of the abovementioned educational policies by taking appropriate organizational measures and by facilitating the involvement of all stakeholders;
(c) Learning environment — the school environment itself respects and promotes human rights and fundamental freedoms. It provides the opportunity for all school actors (students, teachers, staff and administrators and parents) to practice human rights through real-life activities. It enables children to express their views freely and to participate in school life;
(d) Teaching and learning — all teaching and learning processes and tools are rights-based (for instance, the content and objectives of the curriculum, participatory and democratic practices and methodologies, appropriate materials including the review and revision of existing textbooks, etc.);
(e) Education and professional development of teachers and other personnel — providing the teaching profession and school leadership, through pre- and in-service training, with the necessary knowledge, understanding, skills and competencies to facilitate the learning and practice of human rights in schools, as well as with appropriate working conditions and status.

A detailed description of the five components and related courses of action, to serve as a reference tool, is provided in the appendix.

3.2 Minimum action required by States

Paragraph 26 of the Plan of Action on “Stages of the implementation strategy” calls for analysis of the current situation of human rights education in the school system (stage 1); setting priorities and developing a national implementation strategy (stage 2); implementing and monitoring (stage 3); and evaluating (stage 4).

Paragraph 27 of the Plan of Action provides that Member States are encouraged to undertake as minimum action during the first phase (2005-2007) of the World Programme the following:

(a) An analysis of the current situation of human rights education in the school system (stage 1);
(b) Setting of priorities and the development of the national implementation strategy (stage 2);
(c) The initial implementation of planned activities.
II. QUESTIONNAIRE FOR GOVERNMENTS

The questionnaire below to be completed by Governments contains questions that should be addressed in Member States’ national reports. Please mark the specific answers with corresponding numbers of the questions. In addition to the questionnaire, supplementary information may also be provided as additional attachments to your report. Governments are strongly encouraged to involve National Human Rights Institutions and civil society in the preparation of their reports. Please return the completed questionnaire and any other additional information to the Methodology, Education and Training Section at the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (by fax: +41 22 917 9008 or by email: registry@ohchr.org; with copy to wphre@ohchr.org) no later than 31 March 2010. Submissions by email are preferred, but any materials not available electronically may be posted to OHCHR, attn: METS – WPHRE, Palais des Nations, 8-14 Avenue de la Paix, CH-1211 Geneva 10, Switzerland. Replies received by the deadline will be reflected in the evaluation report to be submitted to the UN General Assembly 65th session and may also be uploaded on OHCHR’s website for the World Programme.

Part 1: BASIC INFORMATION

1. Date: 19/03/2010
2. Institution responsible for completing this questionnaire: Ministry of Education and Science
3. Responsible department: Directorate of Pre-University Education
4. Contact person: Pranvera Kamani
5. Mailing address: Ministry of Education and Science
   Rr."Durresi" nr.23, Tirana, Albania
6. Telephone number: 00 355 4 2232455
7. Fax number: 00 355 4 2225832
8. E-mail address: vkamani@mash.gov.al

---

4 This may include but is not limited to relevant information reported to the United Nations Human Rights Treaty Bodies contained in Common Core Documents and Treaty-specific reports, as well as relevant responses to UNESCO (e.g. Forth Consultation on the Implementation of the 1974 Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Cooperation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms), Council of Europe (EDC/HRE programme “Learning and Living Democracy for All” 2006-2009), and other consultations.
A. Educational policies and policy implementation

10. Do education laws, education policies and education policy objectives exist which explicitly refer to the following? 

- Human rights  
- The right to education  
- A rights-based approach to education  
- Human rights education

You may elaborate further if you wish:

11. Is human rights education incorporated in national plans and strategies including those listed below where they exist?

- National human rights plans  
- National plans of action against racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance  
- National poverty reduction strategies and other development plans  
- National sectoral plans for primary and secondary education  
- National plans for Education for All (EFA)  
- National policy frameworks as part of the Decade on Education for Sustainable Development (2005-2014)

If yes to any of the above, please elaborate.

1. The human rights at national level are incorporated in the Constitution of the Republic of Albania adopted in 1989 as well as in other laws and bylaws issued for the implementation of the Constitution.

2. The Law on Pre-University Education, no. 7952, dated 21.06.1995, amended


2. The National Strategy on Pre-University Education was adopted by the DCM no.799, in 2009.

12. Has a national implementation strategy been developed to implement any human rights education policy objective?

---

5 Education policies according to the Plan of Action include legislation, plans of action, curricula and training policies.  
6 Plan of Action, appendix A.2-5.  
7 Plan of Action, appendix A.5(d).
Two National Strategies on Children's Rights have been drafted, the first for 2000-2005 and the second is under implementation for 2005-2010. Both strategies include a special Chapter along with the Plan of Action for the implementation of the children/young people's right to education.

If yes, have young people/learners been involved in both developing the national implementation strategy and in its implementation?

One of the objectives of the Strategy for the Ministry of Education and Science is the enhancement and strengthening of the participation of young people in decision-making. In the "Normative provisions on Pre-University Education", which is a bylaw on whose basis the school performs its activity, Article 37 legitimates the functioning of a "Students' Government" as an independent structure of students through which the active participation of children/young people in the dynamism of the school and its surrounding community is achieved.

Has the strategy been published and disseminated? If yes, please share a copy or refer to a website address if available online.

The National Strategy for Children is already published and it can be found in the Website of the Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities: http://www.mpcs.gov.al

13. Is human rights education present in the national curriculum and educational standards? If yes, please explain its status (e.g. obligatory or optional, subject-based or cross-curricular?).

1. Pre-University Education

The Human rights are officially presented in the basic education curricula in various curricular forms: as part of a given subject, as cross-curriculum and as extra-curricular activities.

1.2. As cross-curriculum.

Objectives that are closely related to the knowledge, application and creation of citizenship attitudes based on the human rights, are easily identified in all subjects of the basic education, respectively in their syllabi.

1.3. Extra-curricular activities.

The Institute for Curricula and Training by means of its publications has prepared manuals with various practical activities, which could be selected and used by schools in their curricular plannings which are already facilitated by the introduction of the free curriculum, that based on the school, by 10 % in basic education, but also in many activities conducted by schools, based on the children/young people's needs and interests.

---

8 Plan of Action, appendix B.10.
9 Plan of Action, appendix A.5(e)(ii)-(iv).
14. Please state whether guidelines exist for writing or revising textbooks that reflect human rights principles?\textsuperscript{10}

Textbooks are drawn up on the basis of the official curriculum which, as above-mentioned, elaborate the issues of human and young people's rights. In this context they are taught through textbooks, according to the topic of the curriculum.

Have textbooks been prepared according to these guidelines?

The process of preparation of textbooks is a competitive one. The Publishing houses are given guidelines on the standards they should comply with while preparing the textbooks for competition. One of the standards is that texts should not convey gender discrimination. In the process of assessment of textbooks, the introduced standards are assessed with points. Priority and better assessment is given to those textbooks which have met the requirements and standards of the guidelines.

15. Please refer to any national or sub-national policies that promote a human rights-based approach to school governance, management, discipline procedures, inclusion policies and other regulations and practices affecting the school culture and access to education.\textsuperscript{11}

Currently, we are implementing 4 National Strategies, namely:

- Strategy on Children Protection;
- Strategy on People with Disabilities;
- National Strategy on improving the living conditions of the Roma community",
- National Strategy on the gender equality and domestic violence 2007 - 2010

All these strategies contribute to the implementation of the supporting policies for the protection, respect and application of human and children's rights at school.

The free curriculum presents a new opportunity. It is conducted at school-basis. In order to apply it, many schools opt to carry out activities related to the education on children's rights and human rights. The "free curriculum" shall be understood to mean that 10 % of the classes are entirely managed by the school and the teachers/professors for the real needs of children. This is a very professional reform which, in itself, protects and supports the children's rights.

16. Is there a comprehensive training policy on human rights education for teachers and other educational personnel in schools?\textsuperscript{12}

3 national projects on human rights protection have been carried out in the last 15 years, respectively: the project "Human Rights Education in School", with the support of ACHR (1994- 2001) and in cooperation with the former Institute of the Pedagogic

\textsuperscript{10} Plan of Action, appendix A.5(e)(viii).
\textsuperscript{11} Plan of Action, appendix A.5(e)(ix).
\textsuperscript{12} Plan of Action, appendix A.5(f).
Studies; the Project "Citizenship and children's rights in the classroom" with the support of TROCAIRE and the former Institute for Curricula and Standards, (2002-2004); the Project "Inter-cultural education and education on human rights" with the support of UNESCO and the Institute for Curricula and Training, (2005-2007).

Every year, there are trainings of teachers. The permanent training modules in these trainings are those related to the knowledge and implementation of human rights in the application of the school curriculum and regarding the interactive methodologies applied in the educational process.

B. Learning environment

17. Are human rights integrated into the learning environments of schools including school governance and management? Please mark on a scale from 1 to 5 (1 = Yes, comprehensively, 5 = Not at all):

Yes, comprehensively 1 2 3 4 5 Not at all

18. Do practices not defined as human rights education exist in your country which reflect the principles of the rights-based approach to education, such as peace education, citizenship and values education, multicultural education, global education, education for tolerance or education for sustainable development? If yes, please explain.

As answered under item 13 of this Questionnaire, all the human rights as well as all values we aim to rear to our pupils/students, such as peace, democratic citizenship education, multiculturalism, global education, education with the spirit of tolerance, or education for the sustainable development, are elaborated as specific topics in the curriculum of different subjects in pre-university education, or as topics of various projects implemented by schools of basic education and the high schools. Thus the project "Inter-cultural education and education on human rights" (2005-2007) was carried out with pilot schools of basic and middle education throughout country, with the support of UNESCO. In the framework of this Project, there have been published textbooks for assisting teachers/professors and pupils/students, namely: "Inter-cultural education in basic education"; "Inter-cultural education and education on human rights in high schools". In addition, the Institute for Educational Development has published a series of materials in the form of modules, on the above-mentioned topics, in order to assist teachers/professors and pupils/students of pre-university education (1-12 grades).

19. Do opportunities exist in schools for students to express themselves freely, to have responsibility, to participate in decision making (in accordance with their age and evolving capacity) and to organize...
for their own interests?\footnote{Plan of Action, appendix C.15(c). See also General comment No. 1, United Nations Committee on the Rights of the Child, which states that “The participation of children in school life, the creation of school communities and student councils, peer education and peer counselling, and the involvement of children in school disciplinary proceedings should be promoted as part of the process of learning and experiencing the realization of rights” (para. 8).} Please mark on a scale from 1 to 5 (1 = Comprehensive opportunities exist, 5 = Not at all):

**Comprehensive opportunities exist**  
1 2 3 4 5 Not at all

- To express themselves
- To have responsibility
- To participate in decision making
- To organize for their own interests

The "Normative Provisions on Pre-University Education" (NPPE) are the fundamental bylaw that regulates the functioning of all the educational-upbringing process in the school, the relations between parents & pupils/students and teachers/professors & school administration. Article 37 of the NPPE legitimates the functioning in all schools of pre-university education of the "pupils/students' Government" which is an independent organisative structure of the pupils/students in the school. It represents the opinion of pupils/students about the issues pertaining to the schooling, learning and their education. Through the "pupils/students' Government" their active participation in the various democratic processes in school and community is ensured. The NPPE defines the right of pupils/students to participate in decision-making and the way to exercise this right; the right to become self-organised and the way to exercise this right.

20. Are there interactions between schools, local government, civil society and the wider community facilitating awareness of children’s rights and the key principles of human rights education?\footnote{Plan of Action, appendix C.15(d).} Please mark on a scale from 1 to 5 (1 = Comprehensive interactions take place, 5 = Not at all):

**Comprehensive interactions take place**  
1 2 3 4 5 Not at all

Schools make efforts to include in the extra-curricular activities, in cooperation with the community, awareness-raising activities regarding the young people's rights. These activities are carried out under the implementation of the educational school programme as extra-curriculum and under the implementation of the school curriculum as a cross-curriculum. The school directorates cooperate also with the community and the different NGOs which carry out projects in the field of human rights.

21. Are monitoring systems in place to assess the following?\footnote{Plan of Action, appendix D.19(f) and B.10(b)(x).} Please mark on a scale from 1 to 5 (1 = Comprehensive monitoring systems, 5 = Not at all):

**Comprehensive monitoring systems**  
1 2 3 4 5 Not at all

- Respect for human rights principles in teaching practice

---

\(15\) Plan of Action, appendix C.15(c). See also General comment No. 1, United Nations Committee on the Rights of the Child, which states that “The participation of children in school life, the creation of school communities and student councils, peer education and peer counselling, and the involvement of children in school disciplinary proceedings should be promoted as part of the process of learning and experiencing the realization of rights” (para. 8).

\(16\) Plan of Action, appendix C.15(d).

\(17\) Plan of Action, appendix D.19(f) and B.10(b)(x).
- Teaching quality with regard to human rights education
- Respect for human rights principles in school management and governance processes\(^\text{18}\)
- Changes in students’ knowledge, skills, values, attitudes and behaviour with regard to understanding of and respect for human rights\(^\text{19}\)

The first two points are being monitored, serving the inspection of schools for the application of the school curriculum. The monitoring of the last two points started in a sporadic manner without entering the system yet.

22. Please outline how schools fund human rights education including sources and the percentage of State budget allocated in this area?\(^\text{20}\)

There is no financial item in the Education Budget, specified for funding the human rights. All the education budget which comprises the costs for teachers/professors' salaries, their training, material and didactics basis and laboratories for the application of the curriculum, budgeting for the transport of pupils/students, budgeting for the schooling of disabled pupils/students, etc., budgeting the constructions and reconstructions of the educational premises etc. in a laic and free of charge educational system as provided for in the Law on Pre-University Education no. 7952, dated 21.06.1995, amended, are indicators of the state budgeting for human rights protection and implementation.

C. Teaching and learning processes

23. Do curriculum subjects in primary and secondary schooling include human rights education?\(^\text{21}\) If so, which curriculum subjects include human rights education at primary and secondary levels?

In the subject of social and civic education there is an individual curricular line related to the human rights, which starts from the first grade through the subject of social education and runs until the fifth grade of the elementary cycle. The categories of children rights, based on the Convention on Children Rights, are taught therein.

From the 6th grade until the 9th grade, in the subject of civic education, there is again a curricular line on human rights which teaches these in relation to the group and community as well as to the education of children in order to live in a democratic and global society.

In 10th - 11th grades there is a curricular line in the subject "Citizenship" which, as a compulsory curriculum, relates to the human rights. In the 11th and 12th grades in the optional curriculum the issues of human rights are taught in the subject of social sciences particularly in sociology.

\(^{18}\) Plan of Action, appendix A.5(e)(ix).
\(^{19}\) Plan of Action, appendix A.5(e)(x).
\(^{20}\) Plan of Action III E.
\(^{21}\) Plan of Action, II B.20 and appendix D.19(a).
How many hours are taught and at what grade levels?

In the compulsory basic education, (1st-9th grades) the subject of social education is taught in 1 class per week for each grade.

In the middle education, (10th - 12th grades), the subject "Citizenship", as a compulsory subject, is taught in 2 classes a week in the 10th grade, 1 class a week in the 11th grade. As an optional curriculum it is taught in the subject of Sociology with up to 2 classes a week in the 11th grade.

24. Do learning methodologies associated with these human rights education activities exist which are child friendly, learner-centred and encourage participation? Please mark on a scale from 1 to 5 (1 = Yes, comprehensively, 5 = Not at all):

Yes, comprehensively 1 2 3 4 5 Not at all

These methodologies are being implemented in all education levels, between 1st and 12th grades. Initially these methodologies have been implemented in pilot grades and schools and subsequently have been spread throughout the country. The quality of their implementation varies in different schools.

25. Which institution(s) has/have the authority to develop, approve and change curricula?

The Ministry of Education and Science is the institution which changes and approves the school curriculum of Pre-University education.

26. Do teacher guides, manuals, textbooks, and other teaching and learning materials in primary and secondary education conform with human rights principles? Please mark on a scale from 1 to 5 (1 = Yes, comprehensively, 5 = Not at all):

Yes, comprehensively 1 2 3 4 5 Not at all

Are materials not produced by your Government being used in schools? If so, who produced them?

The system of textbooks production is a liberalised one, hereupon, they are selected on competition basis. In this competition, Albanian and foreign publishing houses are entitled to participate and those texts which fulfill better the determined standards win out.

D. Training of school personnel

27. Is human rights education included in the following?

---

22 Plan of Action, appendix D.19.
23 Plan of Action, III D.28 and appendix D.19(c).
24 Plan of Action, appendix D.19(c).
Is participation voluntary or mandatory?

The participation is voluntary. The teacher/professor according to the individual need for qualification, selects the module of the annual qualification.

How many hours are offered?

Training classes vary from 20 - 40 classes. Direct training classes, individual work classes and individual work presentation classes are included therein.

28. To what extent is learning, good practice, research and materials collected and made available to educators in human rights education?

The good practices on human rights learning are introduced in the publication of the auxiliary materials for teachers/professors produced by the Institute for Educational Development, or issued in the framework of the projects' implementation always in cooperation with MoES or IED. As a rule these materials are distributed to REDs/EOs throughout the country. The specialists at this level introduce them to teachers/professors.

29. To what extent do recruitment, appraisal and promotion policies for teachers, headmasters and school inspectors reflect human rights principles?

Teachers/professors hiring standards are based on the laws in force which are legitimated from the Constitution of the Republic of Albania. The Constitution of the Republic of Albania, adopted in 1998, directly (with the language of rights) and indirectly (with the language of responsibilities and obligations of the Albanian state) guarantees in 50 out of its 183 articles the fundamental rights of citizens. The treatment in a separate chapter of the fundamental rights and freedoms of the individual, evidences that the Constitution is a guarantee of the state commitment for their implementation. The Albanian Constitution contains all the rights enlisted in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.

30. How are human rights trainings for teachers assessed?

Currently, the teachers/professors training is assessed by credits earned in the tests at the end of the training sessions. Thus, the earning of training credits or the failure to earn them is an indicator of teacher/professor training assessment.

---

26 Plan of Action appendix D.19(d).
28 Plan of Action, appendix E.27(f).
31. To what extent has the Plan of Action for the WPHRE 1st Phase contributed to improving the integration of human rights education into schools systems?

The system for reforming the curriculum in the Republic of Albania started immediately after the democratic changes of 1991 in our country. In this context, the introduction of human rights in the curriculum has been one of the first projects developed in the field of curriculum reform. Thus, the year 2005, which saw the start of the World Programme for Human Rights Education marks the process of the consolidation of education on human rights in the Albanian educational system. In this context a lot of objectives of the first phase of the programme for us were exceeded. We believe that in the current stage of Albania, the program should serve the continuous improvement of the system of human rights promotion, education and implementation.

32. Please indicate the main obstacles to the implementation of the Plan of Action to the 1st Phase of the World Programme in your country on a scale from 1 to 5 (1 = No obstacle, 5 = Major obstacle):

- Lack of awareness of WPHRE at central government level
- Lack of awareness of WPHRE at local government level
- Lack of interest in WPHRE at central government level
- Lack of interest in WPHRE at local government level
- Teachers do not have sufficient training
- Insufficient tools available to implement the programme
- Insufficient financial resources to implement the programme
- Other (please specify):

33. Please indicate any actions undertaken by your country to ensure the World Programme is known amongst (1) education officials, (2) teachers and (3) young people.

The objectives of the World Programme are transmitted to the central and local institutions of the country translated into objectives of these institutions (MoES, REDs/EOs, schools) for the promotion, knowledge and implementation of human rights.

34. Please indicate on a scale from 1 to 5 (1 = Used often, 5 = Not used) the usefulness of the following publications and/or tools available at http://www.ohchr.org/EN/PublicationsResources/Pages/TrainingEducation.aspx

- WPHRE Plan of Action for the 1st phase
- ABC - Teaching Human Rights:
35. (Optional). Please describe the methodology and process adopted in preparing your national evaluation report:

In the preparation of the evaluation report, the evaluations obtained by REDs/EOs have been taken into account. The latter, while preparing their evaluation, have collected opinions and suggestions by the Directors and teachers/professors of the schools of their RED's/EO's jurisdiction. The very important information from the Institute for Educational Development has been utilised for this evaluation.

36. Please make any other comments not provided elsewhere:

THANK YOU.